Carbon Monoxide and Lethal Arrhythmias

Jay P. Farber, Peter J. Schwartz, Emilio Vanoli, Marco Stramba-Badiale, Gaetano M. De Ferrari

University of Oklahoma Health Sciences Center,
Oklahoma City, OK

Includes the Commentary of the Institute's Health Review Committee

Research Report Number 36
The Health Effects Institute (HEI) is a nonprofit corporation founded in 1980 to assure that objective, credible, high-quality scientific studies are conducted on the potential human health effects of motor vehicle emissions. Funded equally by the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) and 28 automotive manufacturers or marketers in the United States, HEI is independently governed. Its research projects are selected, conducted, and evaluated according to a careful public process, including a rigorous peer review process, to assure both credibility and high scientific standards. HEI makes no recommendations on regulatory and social policy. Its goal, as stated by former EPA Administrator William D. Ruckelshaus, is "simply to gain acceptance by all parties of the data that may be necessary for future regulations."

### The Board of Directors

**Archibald Cox** Chairman  
Carl M. Loeb University Professor (Emeritus), Harvard Law School

**William O. Baker** Chairman (Emeritus), Bell Laboratories

**Donald Kennedy**  
President, Stanford University

**Walter A. Rosenblith**  
Institute Professor (Emeritus), Massachusetts Institute of Technology

### Health Research Committee

**Richard Remington** Chairman  
University of Iowa Foundation Distinguished Professor of Preventive Medicine and Environmental Health, University of Iowa

**Joseph D. Brain**  
Geoff K. and Philip Drinker Professor of Environmental Physiology, Harvard University School of Public Health

**Leon Gordis**  
Professor and Chairman, Department of Epidemiology, Johns Hopkins University, School of Hygiene and Public Health

**Curtis C. Harris**  
Chief, Laboratory of Human Carcinogenesis, National Cancer Institute

**Roger O. McClellan**  
President, Chemical Industry Institute of Toxicology

**Robert F. Sawyer**  
Class of 1935 Professor of Energy, University of California at Berkeley

**John W. Tukey**  
Senior Research Statistician and Donner Professor of Science (Emeritus), Princeton University

**Mark J. Utell**  
Professor of Medicine and Toxicology, University of Rochester School of Medicine

**Gerald N. Wogan**  
Professor of Toxicology, Massachusetts Institute of Technology

### Health Review Committee

**Arthur Upton** Chairman  
Professor and Chairman, Institute of Environmental Medicine, New York University

**Bernard Goldstein**  
Professor and Chairman, Department of Environmental and Community Medicine, University of Medicine and Dentistry of New Jersey, Robert Wood Johnson Medical Center

**Gareth M. Green**  
Associate Dean for Education, Harvard School of Public Health

**Millicent W. P. Higgins**  
Associate Director for Epidemiology and Biometry, National Heart, Lung and Blood Institute

**Herbert Rosenkranz**  
Chairman, Department of Environmental and Occupational Health, Graduate School of Public Health, University of Pittsburgh

**Robert M. Senior**  
Professor of Medicine and Director, Respiratory and Critical Care Division, The Jewish Hospital at Washington University Medical Center

**James H. Ware**  
Dean of Academic Affairs and Professor of Biostatistics, Harvard University School of Public Health

**Mary C. Williams**  
Professor of Medicine (Cell Biology), Boston University School of Medicine

**W. Kent Anger** Special Consultant to the Committee  
Associate Director for Occupational and Environmental Toxicology, The Oregon Health Sciences University

### Officers and Staff

**Andrew Sivak** President and Treasurer

**Richard M. Cooper** Corporate Secretary

**Judith Zalon Lynch** Director of Administration and Finance

**Kathleen M. Nauss** Director for Scientific Review and Evaluation

**Jane Warren** Director of Research

**William F. Busby, Jr.** Senior Staff Scientist

**Brenda E. Barry** Staff Scientist

**Aaron F. Cohen** Staff Scientist

**Maria G. Costantini** Staff Scientist

**Bernard Jacobson** Staff Scientist

**Debra A. Kaden** Staff Scientist

**Alison M. Dorries** Consulting Staff Scientist

**Martha E. Richmond** Consulting Staff Scientist

**Ann Y. Watson** Consulting Staff Scientist

**Debra N. Johnson** Controller

**L. Virgi Hepner** Publications Manager

**Gail V. Allosso** Assistant to the Director of Administration and Finance

**Robin A. Cuozzo** Accounting Assistant

**Jean C. Murphy** Research Assistant

**Mary-Ellen Patten** Administrative Assistant

**Kate Rose** Publications Assistant

**Hannah J. Protzman** Secretary

**Joyce L. Speers** Secretary

**Carolyn N. White** Secretary

**Charisse L. Smith** Receptionist

Copyright © 1990 by Health Effects Institute.  
Printed at Capital City Press, Montpelier, VT.  
TABLE OF CONTENTS
Research Report Number 36

Carbon Monoxide and Lethal Arrhythmias

INVESTIGATORS' REPORT  Jay P. Farber, Peter J. Schwartz, Emilio Vanoli, Marco Stramba-Badiale, Gaetano M. De Ferrari

Abstract ........................................ 1  Low-Risk (Resistant) Animals ....................... 4
Introduction ...................................... 1  High-Risk (Susceptible) Animals .................. 6
Specific Aims ..................................... 2  Discussion ........................................ 12
Methods ........................................ 2  Carbon Monoxide and Heart Rate ................. 12
Surgical Preparation ............................. 2  Carbon Monoxide and Cardiac Arrhythmias ...... 13
Experimental Protocol ......................... 2  Critique of the Animal Model .................... 13
Carbon Monoxide Protocol ...................... 3  Clinical Implications ............................. 14
Data Recording .................................. 3  References ......................................... 14
Carbon Monoxide Analysis ...................... 3  About the Authors ............................... 16
Statistical Analysis ............................. 4  Publications Resulting from This Research ...... 17
Results .......................................... 4  Abbreviations .................................... 17

HEALTH REVIEW COMMITTEE'S COMMENTARY  Health Effects Institute

Introduction .................................... 19  Technical Evaluation ............................ 23
Regulatory Background .......................... 19  Attainment of Study Objectives .................. 23
Scientific Background ........................... 20  Assessment of Methods and Study Design ........ 23
Cardiac Arrhythmias ............................ 20  Statistical Methods ............................. 24
Experimental Models ........................... 20  Interpretation of Results ......................... 24
Cardiovascular Effects of Carbon Monoxide ... 21  Implications for Future Research ................ 25
Justification for the Study ..................... 22  Conclusions ...................................... 25
Objectives and Study Design ................... 22  References ....................................... 25
INVESTIGATORS' REPORT

Carbon Monoxide and Lethal Arrhythmias
Jay P. Farber, Peter J. Schwartz, Emilio Vanoli, Marco Stramba-Badiale, Gaetano M. De Ferrari

ABSTRACT

The effect of acute exposure to carbon monoxide on ventricular arrhythmias was studied in a previously described chronically maintained animal model of sudden cardiac death. In 60 percent of dogs with a healed anterior myocardial infarction, the combination of mild exercise and acute myocardial ischemia induces ventricular fibrillation. The events in this model are highly reproducible, thus allowing study by internal control analysis. Dogs that develop ventricular fibrillation during the test of exercise and acute myocardial ischemia are considered at high risk for sudden death and are defined as "susceptible"; dogs that survive the test without a fatal arrhythmia are considered at low risk for sudden death and are defined as "resistant."

In the current study, the effects of carboxyhemoglobin levels ranging from 5 to 15 percent were tested in resistant and susceptible dogs. A trend toward higher heart rates was observed at all levels of carboxyhemoglobin, although significant differences were observed only with 15 percent carboxyhemoglobin. This trend was observed at rest and during exercise in both resistant and susceptible dogs. In resistant animals, in which acute myocardial ischemia is typically associated with bradycardia even under the control condition, this reflex response occurred earlier and was augmented after exposure to carbon monoxide. This effect may depend on the increased hypoxic challenge caused by carbon monoxide, and thus on an augmentation of the neural reflex activation or a sensitization of the sinus node to acetylcholine induced by hypoxia. In both resistant and susceptible dogs, carbon monoxide exposure induced a worsening of ventricular arrhythmias in a minority of cases. This worsening was not reproducible in subsequent trials.

These data indicate that acute exposure to carbon monoxide is seldom arrhythmogenic in dogs that have survived myocardial infarction. Nevertheless, the observation that carbon monoxide exposure increases heart rate at rest and during moderate exercise may have clinical implications relevant to patients with coronary artery disease.

INTRODUCTION

Carbon monoxide (CO) is a widely spread pollutant; it is a constituent of car and heating system exhaust and of cigarette smoke. A causal link between high concentrations of CO in the atmosphere and an increase in cardiovascular mortality has been proposed (Cohen et al. 1969; Eversole et al. 1974; Scharf et al. 1974; Kaufman et al. 1983; Atkins and Baker 1985). Indeed, it has been suggested that even acute air pollution episodes are hazardous to patients with cardiovascular problems. A significant association between community carbon monoxide concentration and mortality has been reported in Los Angeles (Lester and Seskin 1970; Hexter and Goldsmith 1971). A pilot study in Denver reported an increased risk for cardiorespiratory complaints on those winter days with a higher atmospheric concentration of CO (Eversole et al. 1974). These studies could not specifically determine whether or not environmental CO exposure contributes to the more than 400,000 sudden cardiac deaths occurring each year in the United States, mainly in patients with coronary artery disease.

A sudden reduction of the oxygen supply to the heart is often the critical event underlying the occurrence of ventricular fibrillation and sudden cardiac death. Many patients die within minutes after the appearance of symptoms of myocardial ischemia (Baum et al. 1974), and evidence for the occurrence of an ischemic episode just prior to the development of lethal arrhythmias (Roelandt et al. 1984) is growing.

Elevated sympathetic activity may facilitate the occurrence of an ischemic episode and is arrhythmogenic (Jans et al. 1985). Acute myocardial ischemia reflexively increases sympathetic activity thus enhancing arrhythmogenicity (Malliani et al. 1969; Schwartz et al. 1976). The role of the sympathetic nervous system in the genesis of malignant arrhythmias has been demonstrated and reviewed in detail (Schwartz and Priori 1990). Under normal conditions, the heart derives over 90 percent of its energy requirements from aerobic metabolism (Kobayashi and Neely 1979). Within a minute after occlusion of a coronary artery, all aspects of cardiac function are impaired and a marked electrical dishomogeneity of the myocardium occurs; in this condition, sympathetic hyperactivity further increases cardiac electrical instability, and ventricular fibrillation is more likely to develop.

Oxygen supply to the acutely ischemic myocardium, through collaterals, may reduce the effective size of the ischemic area and thereby reduce the risk of life-threatening arrhythmias. Maximal dilatation of collaterals has been shown to occur within seconds after an acute coronary oc-
elusion in dogs (Bishop et al. 1976; Marcus et al. 1976). Even moderate levels of carboxyhemoglobin (COHb) may impair this compensatory mechanism by reducing the oxygen-carrying capacity of the blood and thus its ability to deliver oxygen to the heart tissue.

Little is known of the potential relationship between CO and cardiac arrhythmias. A few experimental studies have suggested that CO lowers the threshold for ventricular fibrillation during acute myocardial ischemia or during the first few days after myocardial infarction (Bellet et al. 1972; DeBias 1976; DeBias et al. 1976; Aronow et al. 1978). The clinical relevance of the studies is limited by the use of anesthesia (Vatner 1978), and by the use of a controversial technique to estimate the ventricular fibrillation threshold (Elharrar and Zipes 1977; Verrier et al. 1978). A clinically relevant experimental model for sudden death has been developed over the last few years in our laboratories (Schwartz et al. 1984). This model incorporates three main factors known to be involved in the genesis of sudden cardiac death: a healed myocardial infarction, acute myocardial ischemia, and physiologically elevated sympathetic activity.

In this experimental preparation, dogs with a prior myocardial infarction engage in a submaximal exercise test, at the end of which a two-minute coronary occlusion is initiated while the dogs are still running. The outcome of the exercise-plus-ischemia test (survival or ventricular fibrillation) allows the identification of two subgroups of animals, one with low risk and one with high risk of sudden death. The events in this model are highly reproducible over time, and allow an internal control analysis, thus overcoming the limitations of group comparison studies.

In conscious post-myocardial-infarction dogs at low risk and at high risk of sudden death, we have investigated the effects of acute exposure to CO on the response to myocardial ischemia during exercise. Results have been presented (Vanoli et al. 1986; De Ferrari et al. 1987) and published (Vanoli et al. 1989).

**SPECIFIC AIMS**

The overall objective of this study was to determine whether or not acute exposure to CO would increase susceptibility to life-threatening arrhythmias in dogs with a healed anterior myocardial infarction. This hypothesis was tested in two separate groups of dogs: one at low risk of sudden death, in which the combination of acute myocardial ischemia and exercise had not induced ventricular tachyarrhythmias under control conditions; the other at high risk of sudden death, in which ventricular fibrillation had occurred during the exercise-plus-ischemia test performed under control conditions.

Both groups of animals were challenged with CO levels consistent with and slightly higher than those observed in heavy smokers.

**METHODS**

Mongrel dogs (102) of either gender weighing 15 to 25 kg were used for the study. Very young (less than one year) and old dogs were excluded by dentition.

**SURGICAL PREPARATION**

Anesthesia was induced with 25 mg of intravenously administered thiopental sodium (Pentothal; Abbott Laboratories, North Chicago, IL) per kilogram of body weight and was maintained by the inhalation of a mixture of halothane, nitrous oxide, and oxygen. With aseptic procedures, a left thoracotomy was performed in the fourth intercostal space. The pericardium was opened and the heart was suspended in a cradle. The left circumflex coronary artery was carefully dissected from the surrounding epicardial fat, and both a 20-MHz continuous-wave Doppler flow transducer and a hydraulic occluder were placed around the vessel. Isolated silver-coated copper wires were sutured to the epicardial surface of both the left and right ventricles to record the electrocardiogram. A Tygon catheter was positioned in the aortic arch to record blood pressure and to collect blood samples.

A modified two-stage occlusion was performed on the left anterior descending coronary artery below the first diagonal branch to produce a myocardial infarction. The vessel was partially occluded for 20 minutes and then completely tied off.

All lead wires were tunneled under the skin to exit from the dorsal surface of the neck. Pentazocine lactate (Talwin, 30 mg; Winthrop Laboratories, New York, NY) was given intramuscularly approximately every 8 hours for the first 24 hours to control postoperative pain. We adhered to the guidelines of the American Physiological Society on the care and treatment of laboratory animals. A Konigsberg pressure cell (Konigsberg Instruments, Pasadena, CA) was successfully implanted in the left ventricle of three animals to measure contractile function (dP/dt).

**EXPERIMENTAL PROTOCOL**

One month after myocardial infarction was induced, all animals performed a submaximal exercise stress test. The
animals ran on a motor-driven treadmill for 12 to 18 minutes while the workload increased every 3 minutes (4.8 kmph, 0 percent grade during first 3 minutes; 6.4 kmph, 16 percent grade during the last 3-minute period). At the beginning of the last minute of exercise, the left circumflex coronary artery was occluded; the treadmill was then suddenly stopped and the occlusion was maintained for another minute. Coronary occlusion was begun either when the animal completed 17 minutes of exercise or when the heart rate had reached a level close to 220 beats/minute. Large steel plates (Model 62w17, American Optical Corp.) were placed across the animal’s chest so that electrical defibrillation could be performed with minimal delay.

Dogs that experienced ventricular fibrillation during this test were identified as at high risk for sudden cardiac death and defined as “susceptible.” Dogs that did not have arrhythmias were identified as at low risk and defined as “resistant.”

**CARBON MONOXIDE PROTOCOL**

**Low-Risk (Resistant) Animals**

The dogs that survived the exercise-plus-ischemia test (low-risk subgroup) performed two or three additional exercise-plus-ischemia tests with different levels of COHb saturation, in a random sequence. Forty-eight hours were allowed for recovery between tests. Before the test, the dogs were exposed to a mixture of 1,500 parts per million (ppm) CO in air (from a premixed cylinder) through a custom-made facial mask. The facial mask and the cylinder were connected by a demand valve and a low-resistance respiratory valve. This procedure raised blood COHb levels by approximately 0.5 percent saturation per minute. Initially, we studied COHb saturations of 10 and 15 percent; on the basis of those responses, the 5 percent COHb saturation level was added subsequently. Blood samples for COHb measurements were taken from the aortic catheter at the beginning and end of the exposure and at the end of the exercise test.

**High-Risk (Susceptible) Animals**

In each animal that developed ventricular fibrillation during the control exercise-plus-ischemia test, the threshold level of work for malignant ventricular arrhythmias (that is, the heaviest workload that was not associated with ventricular tachycardia or fibrillation) was determined.

To accomplish this goal, we repeated the exercise-plus-ischemia test, progressively shortening the duration of exercise and therefore reducing the workload at which the coronary artery occlusion was performed. If ventricular fibrillation still occurred at the lowest workload (five minutes of exercise at 4.8 kmph and 0 percent grade), the duration of the coronary artery occlusion was reduced stepwise by 30 seconds to a minimum of 30 seconds (15 seconds while the dog was running and 15 seconds after the treadmill stopped). If ventricular fibrillation still occurred in this setting, a two-minute coronary artery occlusion (or a shorter occlusion if a two-minute occlusion was associated with malignant arrhythmias) was performed at rest. Dogs were allowed to recover for at least 48 hours between tests.

Once the threshold level for arrhythmias was determined, this same level was used after exposure to CO (as described in the Low-Risk [Resistant] Animals section) with 15 percent COHb. Another test without CO exposure was then performed to ensure that ventricular arrhythmias did not occur at the threshold. Finally, to confirm the reproducibility of the model, the dogs were tested again to confirm that malignant arrhythmias were still present during occlusions above the threshold (see Table 4).

**DATA RECORDING**

During each test, flow velocity in the left circumflex coronary artery, arterial blood pressure, electrocardiogram, and heart rate were recorded on an eight-channel R 612 Beckettman (Palo Alto, CA) direct-writing oscillograph. The signals were also recorded on a magnetic tape (FR-1300; Ampex, Redwood City, CA) for later analysis.

**CARBON MONOXIDE ANALYSIS**

The arterial blood samples were drawn in 3-mL plastic syringes in which the dead space was filled with heparinized saline. The samples were capped using three-way stopcocks. Most of the samples were analyzed for COHb levels immediately after being drawn. In those few instances where analysis could not be done immediately, the samples were temporarily placed on ice. Analyses from initial studies were performed using an IL 182 CO-Oximeter (Instrumentation Laboratories, Lexington, MA); this instrument was replaced with an IL 282 model. The CO-Oximeters had analytical circuitry designed to evaluate dog hemoglobin. The instruments were periodically recalibrated by factory technicians. To check the instruments and perform the user-adjustable calibrations, the applicable standard and test solutions were utilized according to the basic recommendations of Instrumentation Laboratories. Calibration and standard checks were performed more frequently, depending upon use, stability, and maintenance of the instrument (for example, cuvette cleaning). As an added check on the reliability of the IL 182, frequent cross analysis of blood samples was performed against an IL 282.
STATISTICAL ANALYSIS

Data are reported in the text as means ± SD. Statistical analysis was performed by the analysis of variance (ANOVA) for repeated measures followed by the Tukey test for multiple comparisons. Student's t test was used for paired observations. In the resistant group, the fact that a few animals did not perform exercise-plus-ischemia tests at all levels of COHb posed a problem. We analyzed together (using ANOVA) the 11 dogs that were studied at control, 10 percent, and 15 percent COHb levels. Three dogs that did not undergo the 10 percent study were not included in the analysis for statistical reasons; however, their results under control conditions and at 15 percent COHb were indistinguishable from those of the other animals. We also analyzed together (using ANOVA) the six dogs that were studied at the control and 5 percent COHb levels; one of these animals served as control in both groups because it was studied at all levels of COHb. The significance level was p < 0.05.

RESULTS

Data are presented separately for resistant and susceptible dogs. In the first part of the study only resistant dogs were used, and in the second part only susceptible dogs were used.

LOW-RISK (RESISTANT) ANIMALS

To obtain a low-risk population of animals, 50 dogs underwent surgery to place the permanent coronary occlusion and chronic instrumentation. Fourteen of them (28 percent) died within the first 72 hours after myocardial infarction. Six animals (12 percent) were excluded for technical reasons (mainly due to malfunction of the occluder positioned around the circumflex coronary artery). One month after surgery, the remaining 30 dogs underwent the exercise-plus-ischemia test. Of these, 14 dogs (47 percent) had ventricular fibrillation; they were defibrillated and, having been identified as animals at high risk, were assigned to another protocol. The CO exposure protocol was performed in the 16 dogs that did not have life-threatening arrhythmias during the control test and were, therefore, identified as animals at low risk for sudden death. The outline of the events after surgery and of the study design is represented in Figure 1.

Carboxyhemoglobin Levels

The dogs were exposed to the CO-air mixture for sufficient time to allow COHb saturation to reach approximately 5, 10, or 15 percent. At the beginning of the exercise-plus-ischemia test, the COHb saturation levels were actually 6.0 ± 0.6 percent, 13.1 ± 1.6 percent, and 20.8 ± 1.8 percent, respectively. At the end of the coronary occlusion (one minute after cessation of exercise), the COHb saturation levels were 5.0 ± 0.6 percent, 10.2 ± 1.7 percent, and 15.0 ± 1.2 percent, respectively. For simplicity, the results will be presented as being obtained with 5, 10, and 15 percent COHb levels.

Ten dogs were studied at 10 and 15 percent COHb levels, three at 5 and 15 percent levels, two at the 5 percent level, and one at 5, 10, and 15 percent levels. This nonuniform pattern resulted from the fact that in a few dogs, after some trials performed according to the randomized sequence, the hydraulic occluder ruptured, so the remaining trials could not be performed.

Heart Rate

With 15 percent COHb, heart rate was higher (p < 0.05) when compared to the control values both at rest (139 ± 22 versus 117 ± 28 beats/minute) and during exercise (245 ± 20 beats/minute) when compared to the control values both at rest (139 ± 22 versus 117 ± 28 beats/minute) and during exercise (245 ± 20 beats/minute).
18 versus 219 ± 11 beats/minute at the highest workload). Also, with 5 and 10 percent COHb, heart rate was higher than in the control condition, but the difference did not reach statistical significance (Figures 2 and 3; Tables 1 and 2).

The heart rate response to acute myocardial ischemia during exercise was altered importantly by all three levels of COHb (Table 3). For all resistant animals (n = 16) in the control coronary occlusion trials, heart rate during the first 30 seconds of ischemia was practically unmodified (+2 ± 30 beats/minute versus the heart rate level just prior to coronary artery occlusion); heart rate declined by the end of the first minute of ischemia (−13 ± 30 beats/minute). After exposure to CO, the reduction in heart rate occurred much earlier and was of greater magnitude (Figures 4 and 5). The difference in the heart rate response after 30 seconds of ischemia was significant (p < 0.05) for all three levels of COHb: 5 percent, −9 ± 21 beats/minute; 10 percent, −19 ± 36 beats/minute; and 15 percent, −30 ± 26 beats/minute. An example is shown in Figure 6.

After one minute of ischemia, a difference in heart rate, which was not statistically significant, was present only with the 15 percent level of COHb.

Blood Pressure

Systolic arterial pressure was not affected by CO exposure at any level of saturation, either at rest (control, 138 ± 11 mm Hg; 5 percent COHb, 129 ± 15 mm Hg; 10 percent COHb, 134 ± 2 mm Hg; 15 percent COHb, 139 ± 8 mm Hg) or at the maximum workload during exercise (control, 159 ± 11 mm Hg; 5 percent COHb, 158 ± 24 mm Hg; 10 percent COHb, 156 ± 14 mm Hg; 15 percent COHb, 153 ± 20 mm Hg).

Cardiac Arrhythmias

During the control trials, no arrhythmias (fewer than five isolated premature ventricular contractions) were observed in 14 out of 16 animals (87.5 percent). The other two animals (12.5 percent) had repetitive nonfatal ventricular arrhythmias (three to four ventricular couplets) during the exercise-plus-ischemia test. After exposure to CO, one of the two animals that had repetitive ventricular arrhythmias under control conditions developed ventricular tachycardia and the other developed ventricular fibrillation (Figures 7 and 8). These life-threatening arrhythmias occurred at the 15 percent level of COHb. During the CO test at the 15 percent COHb level, 1 of the 14 animals that had no arrhythmias in the control test developed electromechanical dissociation, a situation in which electrical activation of the heart does not produce the consequent mechanical activation. This animal required cardiac massage to prevent irreversible brain damage and death. However, in these three animals, subsequent tests with room air or 15 percent COHb failed to induce arrhythmias.

The remaining 13 animals (61 percent) that had no arrhythmias during the control trial showed the same pattern after CO exposure. At any level, they remained resistant.

HIGH-RISK (SUSCEPTIBLE) ANIMALS

In the second part of the study (second year), fifty-two randomly selected dogs underwent surgery (Figure 9).
### Table 1. Heart Rates (in Beats per Minute) of Resistant Dogs at Rest and During Exercise Under Control Conditions and with 10 and 15 Percent Carboxyhemoglobin Levels

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dog No.</th>
<th>Control 10% COHb</th>
<th>Control 15% COHb</th>
<th>6.4 kmph/4 Percent Slope</th>
<th>6.4 kmph/8 Percent Slope</th>
<th>Before Coronary Artery Occlusion</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Rest</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO1</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO4</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO9</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO10</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO13</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO15</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO21</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO23</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD299</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD298</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD303</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>117</td>
<td>127</td>
<td>139</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>19</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4.8 kmph/0% Percent Slope</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO1</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>245</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO4</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO9</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>215</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO10</td>
<td>195</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>205</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>235</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO13</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO15</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>235</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO21</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO23</td>
<td>205</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD299</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>175</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD298</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD303</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>260</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>192</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>219</td>
<td>219</td>
<td>241</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>23</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6.4 kmph/0% Percent Slope</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO1</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>255</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO4</td>
<td>195</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO9</td>
<td>175</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>195</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO10</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>175</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO13</td>
<td>215</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO15</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO21</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>248</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>250</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO23</td>
<td>205</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD299</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD298</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD303</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>260</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>198</td>
<td>203</td>
<td>226</td>
<td>226</td>
<td>245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Table continues next column.)

Seventeen died within the first 72 hours after myocardial infarction. Five dogs were excluded for technical reasons (mainly due to malfunction of the occluder positioned around the left circumflex coronary artery). One month after myocardial infarction, the remaining 30 dogs underwent the exercise-plus-ischemia test already described.
Table 2. Heart Rates (in Beats per Minute) of Resistant Dogs at Rest and During Exercise Under Control Conditions and with 5 Percent Carboxyhemoglobin Level

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dog No.</th>
<th>Control 5 Percent COHb</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rest</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD295</td>
<td>110 105</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD297</td>
<td>120 130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD298</td>
<td>160 120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD299</td>
<td>120 120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD303</td>
<td>115 120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD304</td>
<td>120 140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>114 123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td>8 12</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.8 kmph/0 Percent Slope

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dog No.</th>
<th>6.4 kmph/4 Percent Slope</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SD295</td>
<td>160 170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD297</td>
<td>200 200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD298</td>
<td>190 190</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD299</td>
<td>200 170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD303</td>
<td>180 180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD304</td>
<td>190 220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>187 188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td>15 19</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

6.4 kmph/0 Percent Slope

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dog No.</th>
<th>6.4 kmph/8 Percent Slope</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SD295</td>
<td>180 200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD297</td>
<td>210 200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD298</td>
<td>210 220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD299</td>
<td>210 240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD303</td>
<td>180 195</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD304</td>
<td>215 245</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>201 217</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td>16 22</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Of these 30 dogs, 13 did not have arrhythmias; they were defined as resistant (at low risk for sudden death) and assigned to another protocol. Seventeen dogs had ventricular fibrillation during the test; they were considered susceptible (at high risk for sudden death) and assigned to the CO exposure protocol.

These susceptible dogs underwent further exercise-plus-ischemia tests to assess the threshold level. Of the 17 dogs, 7 died of ventricular fibrillation while we attempted to identify a threshold level, and 1 dog was excluded because the occluder failed during the study. In the remaining 9 dogs, we were able to establish threshold values. In 1 dog, the threshold level was found at 6.4 kmph and 12 percent grade. In 4 dogs, the threshold level was determined at the lowest workload (4.8 kmph and 0 percent grade) with shortened occlusions (see Methods section): in 2 of the dogs, coronary artery occlusion lasted one minute, starting 30 seconds before the end of exercise; in the other 2 dogs, a coronary artery occlusion of 30 seconds, starting 15 seconds before the end of exercise, was performed. In the other 4 dogs in which ventricular fibrillation had occurred during the exercise protocol, the threshold level could only be determined at rest, even with shortened occlusion times: in 3 dogs the coronary artery occlusion lasted two minutes; in 1 dog, it was maintained for 30 seconds. Therefore, these 9 dogs entered the CO exposure protocol. An example of the CO exposure protocol is shown for 1 dog in Table 4. Of the 5 dogs that had threshold levels during exercise, 3 were also studied under resting conditions; therefore, the data for the resting coronary artery occlusion are based on 7 animals instead of only the 4 with threshold levels at rest. The purpose of studying some dogs both during exercise and at rest was to acquire information on the hemodynamic end reflex responses of high-risk dogs under different experimental conditions.
Table 3. Effects of 5, 10, and 15 Percent Carboxyhemoglobin on Heart Rate Changes During Acute Myocardial Ischemia in Resistant Dogs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dog No.</th>
<th>Control</th>
<th>5 Percent COHb</th>
<th>10 Percent COHb</th>
<th>15 Percent COHb</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Difference in Heart Rate, 30-Second Coronary Artery Occlusion</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD295</td>
<td>-35</td>
<td>-40</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD297</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD298</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD299</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>-30</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD303</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD304</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>15</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>-9</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>21</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Difference in Heart Rate, 60-Second Coronary Artery Occlusion</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD295</td>
<td>-50</td>
<td>-40</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD297</td>
<td>-10</td>
<td>10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD298</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD299</td>
<td>-45</td>
<td>-60</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD303</td>
<td>-50</td>
<td>-50</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD304</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>-25</td>
<td>-23</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>31</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 4. Heart rate response to coronary artery occlusion in the 11 resistant dogs with 10 and 15 percent COHb. Heart rate before coronary artery occlusion was 239 ± 11 beats/minute for control conditions, 226 ± 18 beats/minute for 10 percent COHb, and 245 ± 18 beats/minute for 15 percent COHb. After exposure to CO, coronary artery occlusion caused a pronounced decrease (* = p < 0.05) in heart rate of rapid onset despite continuation of exercise.

Carboxyhemoglobin Levels

In the five animals that underwent exercise-plus-ischemia tests after exposure to CO, the COHb levels were 19.7 ± 1.1 at the beginning of the exercise and 15.3 ± 1.1 at the end of the occlusion. Carboxyhemoglobin levels just prior to the
resting coronary artery occlusion were 15.3 ± 1.1 in the seven animals from which data were derived.

Heart Rate

The heart rate of each dog is shown in Tables 5 and 6. Heart rates were significantly higher in the CO tests compared to control conditions at rest both for the five dogs standing on the treadmill (163 ± 44 beats/minute versus 120 ± 11 beats/minute) (Figure 10) and for the seven dogs lying on the table (135 ± 28 beats/minute versus 114 ± 32 beats/minute) (Figure 11).

Figure 9. Outline of the study of susceptible animals. Seventeen dogs died during the first 72 hours after myocardial infarction and five were subsequently excluded for technical reasons. The 17 susceptible dogs that proved to be susceptible to ventricular fibrillation—and were, therefore, identified as high-risk animals—constitute the population of the second part of the study.
Table 4. Typical Threshold-Level Testing and Carbon Monoxide Exposure Protocol for One Susceptible Dog

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Exercise-Plus-Ischemia Test</th>
<th>Workload of Exercise (kmph/percent slope)</th>
<th>Duration of Coronary Occlusion (seconds)</th>
<th>Outcome</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>6.4/4</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>Ventricular fibrillation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>4.8/0</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>Ventricular fibrillation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>4.8/0</td>
<td>90</td>
<td>Ventricular fibrillation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>4.8/0</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>Ventricular fibrillation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>4.8/0</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>No arrhythmias</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO exposure</td>
<td>4.8/0</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>No arrhythmias</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>4.8/0</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>No arrhythmias</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>4.8/0</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>Ventricular fibrillation</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5. Heart Rate Response (in Beats per Minute) to Coronary Artery Occlusion in the Five Susceptible Dogs Studied with Exercise-Plus-Ischemia Tests Under Control Conditions and After Carbon Monoxide Exposure Resulting in 15 Percent Carboxyhemoglobin

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dog No.</th>
<th>Rest Control</th>
<th>Carbon Monoxide</th>
<th>Before Coronary Artery Occlusion Control</th>
<th>Carbon Monoxide</th>
<th>15-Second Coronary Artery Occlusion Control</th>
<th>Carbon Monoxide</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SD400</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>290</td>
<td>310</td>
<td>305</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD401</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>165</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>190</td>
<td>310</td>
<td>300</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD406</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>225</td>
<td>280</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD431</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>220</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>290</td>
<td>290</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD446</td>
<td>130</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>240</td>
<td>220</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>286</td>
<td>281</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td>11</td>
<td>44</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6. Heart Rate Response (in Beats per Minute) to Coronary Artery Occlusion in the Seven Dogs Studied at Rest Under Control Conditions and with 15 Percent Carboxyhemoglobin

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dog No.</th>
<th>Before Coronary Artery Occlusion Control</th>
<th>Carbon Monoxide</th>
<th>15-Second Coronary Artery Occlusion Control</th>
<th>Carbon Monoxide</th>
<th>30-Second Coronary Artery Occlusion Control</th>
<th>Carbon Monoxide</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SD370</td>
<td>80</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>140</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD382</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>210</td>
<td>240</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD416</td>
<td>170</td>
<td>185</td>
<td>230</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>250</td>
<td>285</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD406</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>150</td>
<td>125</td>
<td>230</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD431</td>
<td>95</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>110</td>
<td>180</td>
<td>175</td>
<td>210</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD446</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>140</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>160</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD486</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>113</td>
<td>118</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average</td>
<td>114</td>
<td>135</td>
<td>138</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>162</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SD</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>46</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the heart rate response to ischemia during exercise, we noted that the dogs with 15 percent COHb showed a smaller increase in heart rate 15 seconds after the beginning of the occlusion (+44 ± 52 beats/minute versus +72 ± 43 beats/minute) than was observed under control conditions, as illustrated in Figure 12. This phenomenon was not present when the occlusion was performed at rest. Here the heart rate was higher after CO exposure (15 percent COHb) through-
Figure 10. Analysis of heart rate during exercise for the five susceptible animals that performed the control exercise-plus-ischemia test and the test with 15 percent COHb. Heart rate was significantly higher (* p < 0.05) with 15 percent COHb before the beginning of exercise.

Figure 11. Analysis of heart rate during the coronary artery occlusion of the seven susceptible animals that performed the control and the 15 percent COHb tests at rest. Heart rate was always significantly higher (* p < 0.05) before and during the coronary occlusion after CO exposure.

Figure 12. Heart rate response to coronary artery occlusion in the five susceptible dogs that performed the control and the 15 percent COHb tests during exercise. Heart rate before coronary artery occlusion was 214 ± 30 beats/minute under control conditions, and 237 ± 36 beats/minute with 15 percent COHb. After exposure to CO, the coronary artery occlusion causes a smaller increase (* p < 0.05) in heart rate.

Figure 13. Heart rate response to coronary artery occlusion in the seven susceptible dogs that performed the control and 15 percent COHb tests at rest. Heart rate before coronary artery occlusion was 114 ± 32 beats/minute under control conditions, and 135 ± 28 beats/minute with 15 percent COHb. After exposure to CO, the increase in heart rate did not change.

out the occlusion (Figure 11), so that the changes in heart rate 15 seconds after the beginning of the occlusion were identical in the two groups (Figure 13).

Blood Pressure

Systolic blood pressure was not affected by CO exposure either at rest (146 ± 12 mm Hg in control versus 151 ± 16 mm Hg after CO) or during exercise (157 ± 12 mm Hg in control versus 176 ± 20 mm Hg after CO). Diastolic blood pressure was similarly unchanged both at rest (96 ± 4 mm Hg in control versus 97 ± 9 mm Hg after CO) and during exercise (102 ± 12 mm Hg in control versus 96 ± 2 mm Hg after CO). Both systolic and diastolic blood pressure changes after 15 seconds of coronary artery occlusion during exercise were unaffected by CO exposure (systolic, -40 ± 9 mm Hg in control conditions versus -25 ± 17 mm Hg after CO exposure; diastolic, -25 ± 4 mm Hg in control conditions versus -11 ± 13 mm Hg after CO exposure). Also, the systolic and diastolic blood pressure responses 30 seconds into coronary artery occlusion at rest were similar under control conditions and after CO exposure (systolic, -7 ± 4 mm Hg in control conditions versus -13 ± 6 mm Hg after CO exposure; diastolic, -2 ± 2 mm Hg in control conditions versus -3 ± 3 mm Hg after CO exposure).

Cardiac Arrhythmias

Ventricular fibrillation occurred in all 17 susceptible
Carboxyhemoglobin levels of 15 percent were achieved in each case. The treadmill exercise was the same as or higher than that used for induction of cardiac arrhythmias.

**DISCUSSION**

These results provide novel information concerning the effects of CO on the cardiovascular system: (1) heart rate is higher at rest and during exercise at all levels of workload after exposure to CO; (2) heart rate response to acute myocardial ischemia is strikingly affected by CO; and (3) acute exposures to CO do not increase the susceptibility to ventricular tachyarrhythmias during a short episode of acute myocardial ischemia in dogs with a healed myocardial infarction.

**CARBON MONOXIDE AND HEART RATE**

**At Rest**

After exposure to CO, resting heart rate was higher in every group of animals in a manner directly proportional to the COHb saturation, even if statistical significance was reached only for the longest exposure time. These results are at variance with reports in men and dogs (Vogel et al. 1972; Wagner et al. 1978) in which brief inhalation of gases with high CO content did not induce an increase in heart rate, but they correlate closely with a study (Adams et al. 1973) in which healthy dogs were exposed to a mixture of 1,500 ppm of CO and air.

Two dogs were tested while breathing air for possible effects of the face mask on heart rate. No change in heart rate could be attributed to the face mask.

**During Exercise**

In our study, heart rate was higher at all workloads during exercise than under control conditions. Carboxyhemoglobin levels of 10 to 20 percent have been shown to cause a heart rate increase during moderate exercise in men but not dogs (Pirnay et al. 1971; Ekbom and Huot 1972; Vogel et al. 1972; Wagner et al. 1978). The study on dogs (Wagner et al. 1978), however, was performed with CO exposure by bolus (22 percent) in trained animals. Our study also provides the first data on animals with a previous myocardial infarction.

**During Myocardial Ischemia**

The heart rate response to acute myocardial ischemia in the resistant dogs was unexpectedly modified by CO at all
levels of COHb. The decrease in heart rate during the first minute of coronary artery occlusion, typical of the dogs at low risk (Schwartz et al. 1984), occurred earlier after CO exposure than in control dogs. On the other hand, in the susceptible dogs, heart rate increased more under control conditions than after CO exposure. The interpretation of these findings is uncertain. Acute myocardial ischemia simultaneously activates sympathetic (Malliani et al. 1973) and vagal (Recordati et al. 1971) sensory endings. This may result in the dominance either of excitatory sympathetic reflexes (Malliani et al. 1969) or of depressor vagal reflexes (Thoren 1978). It may be that the effects of ischemia are enhanced by CO through the attendant hypoxia. This could accelerate the alteration in cardiac geometry which, by the distortion of the sensory endings of the cardiac mecanoreceptors, leads to the excitation of both vagal and sympathetic afferent fibers. Such a sequence of events might explain why the reduction in heart rate occurs earlier with CO, but it would not help to explain why the magnitude of this decrease also tends to be greater. However, the magnitude of the heart rate decrease could depend on the simultaneous presence of higher sympathetic tone (Young and Stone 1976), which would create the conditions for the “accentuated antagonism” (Levy 1971). This potentiation of vagal effects in the presence of elevated sympathetic activity occurs in conscious animals (Stramba-Badiale et al. 1990).

Another possibility along the same lines is raised by the report that a larger ischemic area, as caused by proximal coronary artery occlusion, elicits a predominant vagal response, compared to the prevalent sympathetic response provoked by a more distal occlusion of the same vessel (Lombardi et al. 1984).

An alternative explanation, perhaps more intriguing, is that, by a hypoxia-related mechanism, CO may increase the sensitivity of the sinus node to acetylcholine (Zamfirescu et al. 1969).

The smaller increase in heart rate that was observed in the susceptible group may be due to the higher heart rate at the moment of coronary artery occlusion after CO exposure. Indeed, the heart rate reached by the susceptible dogs, with or without CO, 30 seconds into coronary artery occlusion (280 beats/minute) is almost maximal for dogs; the modification in the reflex response observed after exposure to CO simply may represent the difference between the actual value of heart rate at the moment of coronary artery occlusion and the maximal heart rate obtainable in dogs.

CARBON MONOXIDE AND CARDIAC ARRHYTHMIAS

Although the relationship between exposure to CO and cardiac arrhythmias clearly has important health-related implications, the data available in the literature are scarce and limited in significance.

Using the questionable methodology of the train of pulses, as described by Verrier and colleagues (1978), the effects of CO or of cigarette smoke inhalation on the threshold for ventricular fibrillation were examined (Bellet et al. 1972; DeBias 1976; DeBias et al. 1976; Aronow et al. 1978). It was reported that CO exposure somewhat reduced the ventricular fibrillation threshold, a result interpreted as an index of increased electrical instability. This effect was present both in normal and in ischemic animals.

By contrast, Foster (1981) could not demonstrate arrhythmogenic changes induced by CO by looking for slowed conduction and ventricular tachycardia in acutely ischemic dogs. Similarly, and of importance, given the methodologic accuracy of the study, an abstract by Verrier’s group (Mills et al. 1987) indicates a complete lack of effect of CO on cardiac electrical stability. These data are consistent with the present results.

The present study differs from previous ones because we evaluated cardiac arrhythmias in a clinically relevant setting. The various aspects of assessing the effect of CO exposure at the time of an acute ischemic episode during exercise in conscious animals with a healed myocardial infarction add greatly to the physiologic meaning of the study.

Worsening of arrhythmia or the appearance of a new life-threatening event occurred in 3 out of 16 of the resistant dogs and premature ventricular contractions occurred in 1 out of 9 of the susceptible dogs. These events could never be reproduced and must be viewed as anecdotal. It is probably significant that the only two dogs that had some arrhythmias during the control test both developed malignant arrhythmias after CO exposure in the present model. Still, the nonreproducibility of this finding calls for extreme caution in concluding that there is an important arrhythmogenic effect of CO. On the other hand, the observation that after CO exposure the heart rates were higher at rest and for low levels of exercise may have clinical implications relevant to patients with coronary artery disease, in particular when exposure to CO lasts for days, as during winter in polluted areas (Lester and Saksin 1970).

We interpret these results as indicating that in dogs with healed myocardial infarction, acute exposure to CO is not arrhythmogenic, with occasional exceptions.

The limited data concerning left ventricular contractile function further suggest that moderate COHb levels may not impair cardiac performance accompanying exercise.

CRITIQUE OF THE ANIMAL MODEL

This experimental preparation incorporates the most im-
重要作用的决定因素是突然心脏死亡在人类（Myerburg et al. 1990）：一个被修复的心肌梗死与超负荷的暂时性心肌梗死的叠加在一定程度上能模拟亚临床心肌梗死发生于冠状动脉阻塞的时间。早期死亡率（30%）类似于其他实验室在狗中观察到的心肌梗死的早期死亡率（Trolese-Mongheal et al. 1985; Patterson et al. 1986），并已在实验室中保持一致至少10年。如果我们将这些结果与我们的模型进行比较，我们丢失了102只狗中的41%。在最近的一项研究中，我们比较了不同的狗群，结果表明，超过85%的动物在首次实验后仍处于敏感状态；更多的动物（34%）被排除在实验中，因为实验设计的原因。另外，动物的死亡率在少数几个原因中发生了变化，例如设备故障或死亡。

The two outcomes of the exercise-plus-ischemia test, survival (resistant) or sudden death (susceptible) are characteristically quite reproducible. Billman and associates (1984) showed that 7 of 8 sedentary susceptible animals remained susceptible for 6 weeks. We reviewed two relatively large studies (currently submitted for publication), involving a total of 54 susceptible dogs, in which animals were retested one to three weeks after the initial challenge; more than 85 percent of the animals remained susceptible in each of these studies. Conversion of a resistant animal to a susceptible animal upon retest, with no other intervention, is a rare event. In the present study, all 16 resistant animals and all 9 susceptible animals retained their initial designation. The occurrence of other arrhythmias (for example, premature ventricular contractions or couplets of premature beats) during coronary artery occlusion in the present model has not been reproducible. For this reason, such arrhythmias were not used to evaluate susceptible and resistant animals.

CLINICAL IMPLICATIONS

Given the inability of acute elevations of COHb (up to 15 percent) to induce fatal arrhythmias in dogs with healed myocardial infarctions, it is important to note that results of studies that use the present canine model in other situations appear to be relevant to the problem of sudden cardiac death in humans. Effects in the dog model that have also been observed in cardiac patient populations include an increased risk of sudden cardiac death when baroreceptor reflex sensitivity (Schwartz et al. 1988) or heart rate variability (Hull et al. 1990) are low, and a decreased incidence of sudden death after left stellate ganglion ablation (Janse et al. 1985).

The preceding results, we believe, allow cautious extrapolation to the clinical setting. The present data suggest that many patients with infarcts may not be endangered by brief exposure to the COHb levels observed in our study. Two other possibilities should also be considered. The first is that CO does not represent the same risk in humans and dogs because of mechanistic considerations that have not yet been evaluated. A second issue is that some subpopulation of humans with myocardial infarctions may be susceptible to the effects of brief exposure to CO, even if such exposure has little effect in the majority of patients.

It is very important to note that the present data do not consider the potentially detrimental effect of chronic exposure to CO. Two particularly important issues are the role of CO in the development of atherosclerosis (Astrup and Kjeldsen 1979; Balraj 1984) and the role of CO in the development of cardiomyopathy (Penney et al. 1984; Clibb et al. 1986).

REFERENCES


Billman GE, Schwartz PJ, Stone HL. 1984. The effects of
daily exercise on susceptibility to sudden cardiac death.

Bishop SP, White FC, Bloor CN. 1976. Regional myocardial
blood flow during acute myocardial infarction in the con­

Clubb FJ, Penney DG, Baylerian MS, Bishop SP. 1986. Cardi­
omegaly due to myocyte hyperplasia in perinatal rats ex­
posed to 200 ppm carbon monoxide. J Mol Cell Cardiol
18:477–486.

Cohen SI, Deane M, Goldsmith JR. 1969. Carbon monoxide
and survival from myocardial infarction. Arch Environ
Health 19:510–517.

DeBias DA. 1976. Effect of carbon monoxide inhalation on
the vulnerability of the heart to induced ventricular fibrilla­
tion. In: Clinical Implications of Air Pollution Research
(Finkel AJ, Duer WC, eds.) pp. 119–126. Publishing
Sciences Group, Acton, MA.

DeBias DA, Bannerjee CM, Birkhead NC, Greene CH, Scott
SD, Harrer WV. 1976. Effects of carbon monoxide inhalation

De Ferrari GM, Vanoli E, Stramba-Badiale M, Farber JP,
Schwartz PJ. 1987. Moderate hypoxia and incidence of sud­
en death in a chronic dog model. Eur Heart J 8(Suppl
2):82.

Ekblom B, Huot R. 1972. Response to submaximal and max­
imal exercise at different levels of carboxyhemoglobin. Acta
Physiol Scand 86:474–482.

Elharrar V, Zipes DP. 1977. Cardiac electrophysiologic alter­
dations during myocardial ischemia. Am J Physiol 233:
H329–H345.

Eversole BD, Orleans M, Briese FW. 1974. An epidemiologic
study of carbon monoxide and mortality in Denver 1969–
1971. In: Carbon Monoxide and the People of Denver (Or­
leans M, White GF, eds.) pp. 125–163. Institute of Behavioral
Sciences, University of Colorado, Boulder, CO.

Foster JR. 1981. Arrhythmogenic effects of carbon monoxide
in experimental acute myocardial ischemia: Lack of slowed
conduction and ventricular tachycardia. Am Heart J 102:
876–882.

Hexter AC, Goldsmith JR. 1971. Carbon monoxide: Associa­
tion of community air pollution with mortality. Science

Hull SS, Evans AR, Vanoli E, Adamson PB, Stramba­
Heart rate variability before and after myocardial infarction
in conscious dogs at high and low risk of sudden death. J
Am Coll Cardiol 16:978–985.

D. 1985. Effects of unilateral stellate ganglion stimulation
and ablation on electrophysiological changes induced by

Kaufman DW, Helmrich SP, Rosenberg L, Miettinen OS,
Shapiro S. 1983. Nicotine and carbon monoxide content of
cigarette smoke and the risk of myocardial infarction in

Kobayashi K, Neely JR. 1979. Control of maximum rates of

Science 169:723–733.

Levy MN. 1971. Sympathetic-parasympathetic interactions

Lombardi F, Casalone C, Della Bella P, Malfatto G, Pagani
M, Malliani A. 1984. Global versus regional myocardial
ischemia: Differences in cardiovascular and sympathetic

of afferent cardiac sympathetic fibers with atrial and ven­

Mills AK, Skornik WA, Walles LM, O'Rourke JJ, Hennessey
RM, Verrier RL. 1987. Effects of carbon monoxide on cardiac
electrical properties during acute coronary occlusion (ab­

Myerburg RJ, Kessler KM, Interian A Jr, Fernandez P,
Kimura S, Kozlovsksis PL, Fukuawa T, Bassett AL, Castel­
lanos A. 1990. Clinical and experimental pathophysiology
of sudden cardiac death. In: Cardiac Electrophysiology:
From Cell to Bedside (Zipes DP, Jalife J, eds.) pp. 666–678.

Patterson E, Scherlag BJ, Lazarra R. 1986. Mechanism of
prevention of sudden death by nadolol: Differential actions
on arrhythmia triggers and substrate after myocardial in­
farction in the dog. J Am Coll Cardiol 8:1365–1372.


ABOUT THE AUTHORS

Jay P. Farber, Ph.D., is Professor of Physiology and Biophysics at the University of Oklahoma Health Sciences Center. His graduate training was in the area of respiratory physiology in the Department of Physiology at The State University of New York at Buffalo. His postdoctoral work at Dartmouth Medical School was in regulation of breathing. Dr. Farber’s research has involved several aspects of cardio-pulmonary regulations.

Peter J. Schwartz, M.D., is Professor of Medicine at the University of Milano, Italy, at the Centro di Fisiologia Clinica e Ipertensione, and Visiting Professor of Physiology at the University of Oklahoma. He graduated in medicine and became a specialist in cardiology at the University of Milano. Professor Schwartz developed his career in the area of sudden cardiac death, in particular, he gave major input for the understanding and development of new therapeutic
strategies for the long QT syndrome and for the problem of sudden cardiac death in patients with coronary artery disease.

Emilio Vanoli, M.D., is a researcher at the University of Milano, Italy, at the Centro di Fisiologia Clinica e Ipertensione in the group directed by Professor Schwartz, and Visiting Assistant Professor at the Department of Physiology at the University of Oklahoma. Dr. Vanoli graduated in medicine and became a specialist in cardiology at the University of Milano. Sharing his time between Italy and the United States, Dr. Vanoli developed his expertise in the area of sudden cardiac death in coronary artery disease at both the experimental and clinical level.

Marco Stramba-Badiale, M.D., is a researcher at the University of Milano, Italy, at the Centro di Fisiologia Clinica e Ipertensione, and Visiting Assistant Professor at the University of Oklahoma. Dr. Stramba-Badiale graduated in medicine and became a specialist in cardiology at the University of Milano. He has been involved for many years in research projects concerning sudden cardiac death. Currently he is developing new models to study the role of the autonomic nervous system in the genesis of sudden infant death.

Gaetano M. De Ferrari, M.D., is a researcher at the University of Milano, Italy, at the Centro di Fisiologia Clinica e Ipertensione, and Research Associate at the University of Oklahoma. Dr. De Ferrari graduated in medicine and became a specialist in cardiology and in statistics at the University of Milano. He contributed significantly to a large experimental project concerning sudden cardiac death. Dr. De Ferrari is currently working in the Coronary Care Unit of the University Hospital in Milano.

**PUBLICATIONS RESULTING FROM THIS RESEARCH**


**ABBREVIATIONS**

ANOVA analysis of variance  
CO carbon monoxide  
COHb carboxyhemoglobin  
dP/dt an index of contractile function  
ppm parts per million  
SD standard deviation
INTRODUCTION

In the summer of 1984, the Health Effects Institute (HEI) issued a Request for Applications (RFA 84–2) soliciting proposals for "Acute Effects of Carbon Monoxide on Cardiac Rhythm." In response to this RFA, Dr. H. Lowell Stone, of the Department of Physiology and Biophysics, University of Oklahoma Health Sciences Center, Oklahoma City, OK, submitted a proposal entitled "Carbon Monoxide and Lethal Arrhythmias." The HEI approved the two-year project, which began in July 1985. Total expenditures were $354,674. Upon the death of Dr. Stone, Dr. Jay P. Farber, of the same department, became the principal investigator. Dr. Peter J. Schwartz, a cardiologist and a long-term collaborator with Dr. Stone, who was a coprincipal investigator on the original proposal, continued his participation in the project. The Investigators' Report was received at the HEI in October 1987 and was accepted by the Health Review Committee in January 1989. During the review of the Investigators' Report the Review Committee and the investigators had the opportunity to exchange comments and to clarify issues in the Investigators' Report and in the Review Committee's Commentary. The Commentary is intended to place the Investigators' Report in perspective as an aid to the sponsors of the HEI and to the public.

REGULATORY BACKGROUND

The Clean Air Act mandates that the U.S. Environmental Protection Agency (EPA) establish primary standards for air pollutants based on health effects and at levels "requisite to protect the public health . . . allowing an adequate margin of safety." The legislative history of the act makes it clear that in setting the National Ambient Air Quality Standards (NAAQS)¹, the EPA is required to consider the health of particularly sensitive subgroups of the population. The Senate report on the legislation states: "An ambient air quality standard . . . should be the maximum permissible air level of an air pollution agent or class of such agents (related to a period of time) which will protect the health of any group of the population" (U.S. Senate 1970).

The identification of such groups is not clearly defined, but the Senate report does specify that "included among those persons whose health should be protected by the ambient standard are particularly sensitive citizens (such as bronchial asthmatics and emphysematics) who in the normal course of daily activity are exposed to the ambient environment." The report further states that "in establishing an ambient standard necessary to protect the health of these persons, reference should be made to a representative sample of persons comprising the sensitive group rather than to a single person in such a group."

The current primary NAAQS for carbon monoxide is 9 parts per million (ppm), averaged over eight hours, and 35 ppm, averaged over one hour, both not to be exceeded more than once a year. Established in 1971, this standard was based on a study by Beard and Wertheim (1967), who reported an effect on the central nervous system (impairment in discrimination of time intervals) when the carboxyhemoglobin (COHb) levels of human subjects reached two percent. Several subsequent studies, however, failed to replicate these findings (Stewart et al. 1970; O'Donnell et al. 1971; Otto et al. 1979).

During the 1970s, three studies reported that carbon monoxide exposure (50 and 100 ppm for one to four hours) aggravated the symptoms associated with cardiovascular disease. The studies by Aronow and Isbell (1973) and by Anderson and coworkers (1974) reported a similar result in patients with intermittent claudication (ischemia of the muscles due to sclerosis with narrowing of the arteries). After these reports, the EPA proposed to lower the one-hour standard from 35 ppm to 25 ppm. This lower standard was never implemented, in part because of the inadequacy of the available data. In 1985, the EPA (U.S. Environmental Protection Agency 1985) decided not to revise the existing standard but is, at present, in the process of reviewing several human health effects studies that have been completed recently as part of their mandated periodic reevaluation of the criteria pollutant standard for carbon monoxide (Sheps et al. 1987; Adams et al. 1988; Allred et al. 1989a,b; Kleinman et al. 1989).

The known ability of carbon monoxide to interfere with tissue oxygen delivery could account for the exacerbation of cardiac symptoms. Whether or not carbon monoxide-induced hypoxia also causes heart disease, or induces potentially life-threatening effects, such as arrhythmias, has not been well studied. Investigations of the arrhythmia-producing effects of carbon monoxide exposure in experimental models of cardiovascular disease have the potential to contribute knowledge useful in evaluating probable health effects in humans. This information is essential for informed regulatory decision making required by the Clean Air Act.

¹ A list of abbreviations appears at the end of the Investigators' Report for your reference.
SCIENTIFIC BACKGROUND

CARDIAC ARRHYTHMIAS

Heart disease, the most prevalent form of which is ischemic heart disease (commonly referred to as coronary artery disease), is the leading cause of disability and death in industrialized nations (Levy and Feinleib 1984). Ischemic heart disease refers to a spectrum of clinical disorders of the heart resulting from an imbalance between the myocardial need for oxygen and the adequacy of the blood supply (Robbins and Cotran 1979). Reduction in coronary blood flow is almost always the cause of this imbalance and is most often due to atherosclerosis, the formation of lipid deposits in the large- and medium-sized arteries. Occlusion of the coronary artery by lipid deposits results in inadequate delivery of blood, and hence oxygen, to the myocardial tissue. The resulting myocardial ischemia can be further exacerbated by increased oxygen demand, as occurs with exercise, or by impairment in the oxygen-carrying capacity of the blood, as occurs with anemia or carbon monoxide-induced hypoxia. Severe myocardial ischemia can lead to myocardial infarction (heart attack).

In the normal human heart, the heartbeat originates in the sinoatrial node, with each myocardial cell then being activated in an organized programmed sequence via the heart's specialized conduction system. Abnormal cardiac rhythms may result whenever interruptions in the blood supply and oxygen delivery occur, due to disordered impulse formation or altered conduction within the myocardial tissue, or both. In abnormal conditions, an ectopic focus (a focus other than the sinoatrial node) may discharge, resulting in a beat that occurs before the expected next normal beat, thereby transiently interrupting the cardiac cycle (an extrasystole or premature beat). Conduction delay and block in ischemic myocardial tissue can also cause arrhythmias. Such a block usually results from partial obstruction of the blood flow due to either atheroma (lipid deposits characteristic of atherosclerosis) or thrombosis (a clot formed from constituents of blood).

A rapid and irregular discharge of impulses arising from ectopic foci or impaired conduction, or both, can produce atrial or ventricular fibrillation. When extrasystoles initiate fibrillation within the ventricles, the heart is unable to pump blood effectively throughout the systemic circulation and death results (Ganong 1985). Ventricular fibrillation is the most serious arrhythmia that can occur as a consequence of ischemic heart disease (Goldman 1979) and it causes more than 80 percent of the deaths due to heart attacks.

Exercise tests are often used in conjunction with other stimuli to evaluate cardiac function because exercise may induce an otherwise intermittent arrhythmia. At the onset of exercise, an increased sympathetic discharge to the heart occurs. As a result, cardiac output and heart rate increase, vascular beds in the muscles dilate, and vasculature in other parts of the body constricts. This altered peripheral resistance diverts blood flow to the exercising muscles and away from other organs (Berne and Levy 1981; West 1985).

During exercise, increased oxygen transport to the heart occurs primarily through increased heart rate. Although coronary blood flow can increase sufficiently in healthy individuals at all levels of exercise, individuals with ischemic heart disease may not be able to sustain adequate coronary blood flow during exercise. Disturbances in the coordination of heart rate and blood flow, as the heart attempts to increase cardiac output, can ultimately cause cardiac arrhythmias. Any decreased availability of oxygen within the blood due to the presence of carbon monoxide can further exacerbate the lack of oxygen delivery to the heart.

Much of what is known about derangements of cardiac rhythm has come from animal models of myocardial ischemia. As early as 1894, Porter noted that "fibrillar contractions" often followed occlusion of the coronary artery and that irregular cardiac rhythm preceded fatal ventricular fibrillation (Porter 1894). Valdo and Kaiser (1973) found that in dogs with coronary artery ligation, areas of myocardial ischemia had periods of localized fibrillation. Citing animal studies in both the dog and pig, investigators have noted that myocardial ischemia in laboratory animals affects the electrophysical properties of ventricular myocardial cells, and leads to electrical instability of the myocardium. Thus, in animal models, the evidence supports the hypothesis that both myocardial ischemia and neural activity can alter cardiac vulnerability and predispose the heart to ventricular fibrillation.

EXPERIMENTAL MODELS

The dog has been the model of choice for studies of myocardial ischemia because the normal canine coronary vas-
cicular system resembles that of humans who have developed coronary artery disease. Specifically, humans with severe ischemia can avert myocardial infarction by use of collateral vessels that are able to take over blood flow lost by occluded coronary arteries (Braunwald and Alpert 1984). In the healthy human heart, there are virtually no functional intercoronary channels; however, severe or advanced coronary stenosis (narrowing of the coronary artery) induces progressive enlargement of small arterial collaterals and development of new collateral channels from preexisting capillaries. These new blood vessels are critical in preventing ventricular fibrillation (Berne and Levy 1981; Braunwald and Alpert 1984; Epstein et al. 1989). In contrast, the normal dog heart has coronary collateral vessels that link the branches of the major coronary arteries, thereby providing immediate epicardial collateral flow after acute coronary artery occlusion. Because coronary stenosis induces the development of collateral vessels in humans, many researchers believe the dog is the best available animal model to study human coronary artery disease (Gross 1985); others, however, prefer the pig as a model because, compared to dogs, atherosclerotic plaques in swine more closely resemble those in humans (Eckstein 1954; Brooks et al. 1975; Gross 1985).

The experimental model for arrhythmias that has been studied the most extensively is that of dogs in which the anterior descending coronary artery has been occluded to produce a myocardial infarction. The creation of infarction by coronary ligation allows the investigator to produce spontaneous and triggered arrhythmias. Animals with healed myocardial infarctions, such as those used by Farber and his coworkers, are considered to be good models to study stabilizing and unstabilizing influences on ventricular fibrillation. One advantage of this model is that the effects of carbon monoxide exposure could be evaluated in conscious animals, eliminating the possible confounding effects of anesthesia on the physiologic parameters being measured.

**CARdiovascular EFFECTS OF CARbon MONoxide**

Individuals with coronary artery disease are affected by alterations of coronary blood flow and oxygen transport to the heart; they are also susceptible to other factors that may influence cardiac oxygen consumption. One such factor is believed to be exposure to carbon monoxide. The health effects of carbon monoxide exposure are thought to arise largely from interference with the oxygen-carrying function of the blood.

Under normal conditions, inhaled oxygen diffuses rapidly across the alveolar walls of the lung and binds to hemoglobin inside the red blood cells. The oxyhemoglobin complex is transported in the blood, and the oxygen is eventually released into the tissues. If carbon monoxide is present in the inhaled air, the carbon monoxide and oxygen compete for the oxygen-binding sites on the hemoglobin molecules. Because the affinity of hemoglobin for carbon monoxide is 240 times greater than for oxygen, COHb forms and the oxygen-carrying capacity of the red blood cells is reduced. In addition, delivery of oxygen to the tissues is further impaired because, in the presence of carbon monoxide, hemoglobin releases oxygen to the tissues more slowly. The resulting tissue hypoxia may cause transient or permanent damage, especially in those organs that demand high oxygen delivery, such as the brain and heart.

Tissue hypoxia in the myocardium initiates a variety of compensatory responses, such as increased cardiac output and vasodilation, that are directed toward increasing the rate of oxygen delivery to the heart. Because of their limited ability to increase blood flow, individuals with coronary artery disease comprise a subpopulation that is potentially susceptible to adverse health effects when exposed to relatively low levels of carbon monoxide (U.S. Environmental Protection Agency 1985).

Clinical and animal studies have produced limited information with regard to the potential arrhythmogenic effects of carbon monoxide exposure. In men with coronary artery disease, exposure to low levels of carbon monoxide (resulting in 2 to 4 percent COHb) while exercising decreased the time to the onset of myocardial ischemia (Allred et al. 1989a,b). A study of normal subjects and subjects with coronary artery disease and no baseline ectopy (Hinderliter et al. 1989) failed to demonstrate an arrhythmogenic effect of carbon monoxide exposure. There has, however, been a recent report of an effect of carbon monoxide exposure on ventricular arrhythmias in subjects with coronary artery disease and some degree of preexisting rhythm irregularity (Sheps et al. 1990). In the latter study, subjects experienced an increase in arrhythmias when COHb levels were elevated to 6 percent during exercise. No effect was seen at rest or in exercising subjects with 4 percent COHb.

A limited number of investigations of cardiac vulnerability to ventricular fibrillation, under conditions of acute and chronic carbon monoxide exposure, have been conducted in laboratory animals. The results of these studies are equivocal. In agreement with the studies in human subjects, abnormal electrocardiograms have been reported in dogs (Preziosi et al. 1970; Sekiya et al. 1983) and in Cynomolgus monkeys (DeBias et al. 1973) exposed to carbon monoxide. DeBias and coworkers (1976) also reported that the threshold for transthoracic induction of ventricular fibrillation was reduced in normal monkeys, and in animals with experimental myocardial infarctions, after a six-hour exposure to 100 ppm of carbon monoxide (mean COHb was 9.3 percent). In the latter study, the number of animals was
small (four to six monkeys per group), and the normal animals did not receive a sham air exposure but breathed ambient laboratory air.

A reduced ventricular fibrillation threshold was also reported after a two-hour exposure to 100 ppm carbon monoxide (mean COHb was approximately 6 percent) in normal dogs (Aronow et al. 1979) and in dogs with acute myocardial infarctions (Aronow et al. 1978). Interpretation of the results of Aronow and coworkers (1976, 1979) is complicated by the fact that while the mean threshold for ventricular fibrillation after exposure to carbon monoxide was lower than the preexposure threshold, the threshold increased by the same amount in the control animals after exposure to compressed air, a factor that may have biased interpretation of the data. In contrast to these reports, Foster (1981) found no effects of carbon monoxide exposure (mean COHb was 10.4 percent) on ventricular arrhythmias or on ischemic conduction delay in dogs with acute experimental myocardial ischemia.

**JUSTIFICATION FOR THE STUDY**

The effects of carbon monoxide exposure on cardiac function have been examined in a number of experimental systems. It is not, however, known whether or not exposure to carbon monoxide affects the incidence of ventricular arrhythmias in normal subjects or in subjects with cardiovascular disease. The HEI solicited proposals under RFA 84–2, "Acute Effects of Carbon Monoxide on Cardiac Rhythm," for research on the effects of carbon monoxide exposure, at or near ambient levels, on myocardial excitability. Investigations using animal models of susceptible human populations, and clinical or epidemiological studies of susceptible individuals, were all considered relevant.

After reviewing the proposals submitted under RFA 84–2, the HEI Research Committee decided to support four research projects, two studies to determine the effects of carbon monoxide exposure on cardiac electrical stability in animal models, and two human clinical studies to evaluate the effects of carbon monoxide exposure on subjects with ischemic heart disease and ventricular arrhythmias. By supporting diverse biological models and end points, the Institute's goal was to develop a comprehensive research program to determine the effects of carbon monoxide exposure on the occurrence of arrhythmias and on susceptibility to ventricular fibrillation.

**OBJECTIVES AND STUDY DESIGN**

The primary objective of the study was to determine if exposure to carbon monoxide has an effect on cardiac electrical stability in dogs that had survived an acute myocardial infarction. The investigators used a previously described animal model that incorporated two factors that are known to increase the risk of ventricular fibrillation, healed myocardial infarction and acute myocardial ischemia (Schwartz et al. 1984; Schwartz 1986). In this model, unanesthetized dogs with a healed anterior wall myocardial infarction are challenged with mild exercise and acute coronary artery occlusion. Those dogs that experience ventricular fibrillation during the brief coronary occlusion are considered by the investigators as "susceptible" to arrhythmias and subsequent sudden death; those dogs that do not experience ventricular fibrillation are defined as "resistant."

The investigators had previously demonstrated differences in the reflex heart rate of susceptible and resistant dogs during the ischemia-plus-exercise protocol. The reflex heart rate usually decreases in animals that survive and increases in dogs that develop ventricular fibrillation (Schwartz 1984). They hypothesized that two related factors, the activity of the autonomic nervous system and the ischemia-induced reduction in heart rate, were responsible for the difference in electrical stability between the susceptible and resistant animals (Schwartz et al. 1984; Schwartz 1986). They postulated, further, as the basis for this study, that elevated levels of COHb would increase the extension and severity of myocardial ischemia after coronary artery ligation, making the animals more susceptible to cardiac arrhythmias.

Two separate groups of animals were used to study resistant and susceptible dogs. First, myocardial infarctions were produced in mongrel dogs (50 to 52 per group) by occluding the left anterior descending coronary artery. During surgery, a pneumatic occluder was also placed around the left circumflex coronary artery. One month later, the surviving animals with healed myocardial infarctions (30 per group) performed a submaximal exercise test (12 to 18 minutes of exercise with increasing workload). Acute myocardial ischemia was induced by occluding the left circumflex coronary artery for two minutes, beginning at the last minute of exercise and extending through the first minute after exercise ceased. Animals that experienced ventricular fibrillation during the exercise-plus-ischemia test were identified as being at high risk for ventricular fibrillation and were defined as "susceptible"; animals that did not have arrhythmias were defined as "resistant." Seventeen dogs entered the study as susceptible animals, sixteen as resistant.

The investigators then evaluated the possible arrhythmogenic effect of exposure to carbon monoxide in the two groups of animals. Resistant animals were exposed to relatively high levels of carbon monoxide (1,500 ppm) for the period of time needed to achieve 5, 10, or 15 percent COHb
saturation. The exercise-plus-ischemia test was performed immediately after the carbon monoxide exposure. Carboxyhemoglobin levels, heart rate, blood pressure, and the electrocardiographic response were measured at different time intervals during the procedure.

Because the susceptible animals, by definition, developed arrhythmias during the standard exercise-plus-ischemia test, they were treated in a somewhat different manner. The investigators first determined the threshold for fatal arrhythmias for the exercise-plus-ischemia protocol for each animal. Susceptible animals were then exposed to carbon monoxide (resulting in 15 percent COHb), either at rest or during exercise, using the predetermined threshold conditions. The cardiac parameters described above were measured during and after the coronary artery occlusion.

**TECHNICAL EVALUATION**

**ATTAINMENT OF STUDY OBJECTIVES**

The authors conducted experiments studying the effects of three carbon monoxide–exposure conditions on dogs with surgically induced myocardial ischemia. A limited number of animals, defined as either "susceptible" or "resistant" to fatal arrhythmias, were tested under each protocol. The technical and experimental limitations of the study, including unstable COHb levels and uncertain infarct size, as well as the small sample sizes, limit the interpretation of the investigators’ findings.

**ASSESSMENT OF METHODS AND STUDY DESIGN**

Farber and his coworkers used a postinfarction sudden-death model, in which brief occlusion of the coronary artery is coupled with submaximal exercise in conscious dogs with a healed anterior wall myocardial infarction. The study design hinged on the postsurgical division of mongrel dogs into two groups, "susceptible" and "resistant", on the basis of whether or not the animals developed ventricular fibrillation after preliminary challenge procedures; these procedures included exercise and an acute episode of myocardial ischemia (Schwartz et al. 1984; Schwartz 1984).

The investigators had extensive experience with the postinfarction sudden-death model (Schwartz et al. 1984; Schwartz 1986). There are, however, concerns regarding the experimental protocol, sample size, and the generalizability of the reported responses.

A total of 102 dogs entered the study. The surgical procedures required to induce the initial myocardial infarction and to apply the instrumentation resulted in a high mortality rate (30 percent) and a technical failure rate of 11 percent. In addition, 41 percent of the animals identified as susceptible died during subsequent testing for the threshold for ventricular fibrillation. The authors state that these results are consistent with previous experience in their laboratory. Due to the high operative and experimental mortality, only 25 animals (25 percent of the original sample) were exposed to carbon monoxide, 16 resistant dogs and 9 susceptible animals. The number of animals in individual subgroups was often below acceptable levels for statistical analysis. For example, the total number of dogs exposed to all three concentrations of COHb is one for the resistant group and none for the susceptible group. The model previously had been characterized with regard to the reproducibility of the rates of survival after the surgical procedures, and the reproducibility of ventricular fibrillation during the exercise-plus-ischemia test in susceptible and resistant animals (Billman et al. 1984).

The high mortality rate in this study, although consistent with the investigators’ previous experience, raises concerns about possible bias in the sample used for testing. Measurements of cardiological parameters could only be performed in animals that survived the experimental procedure (25 percent). The data, therefore, may not reflect the true effects of myocardial ischemia and exposure to carbon monoxide, thus restricting the generalizability of the results.

While the authors provided sufficient details about the surgical procedures, other technical aspects were not adequately documented. One weakness of this report is the lack of detail regarding the carbon monoxide exposures. No information was provided on the design and monitoring of the exposure system, the duration of individual exposures, respiration rates, and individual COHb data. As will be discussed below, there was a high degree of variability in the reported mean COHb levels, but because of the lack of experimental detail, it cannot be determined if the variability was the result of inaccurate COHb measurements, the design of the exposure apparatus, or the exposure protocol. A sham exposure was not part of the study design, although two dogs so tested while breathing air showed no effects of the face mask on heart rate. A sham exposure for all animals would have been useful to determine if the experimental procedures affected heart rate.

The animals were exposed to high concentrations of carbon monoxide (1,500 ppm) for short periods of time to achieve before-exercise COHb values of 5, 10, or 15 percent, as determined by CO-Oximeter measurements of arterial blood samples. The authors state the COHb concentrations actually measured in resistant dogs were 6.1 ± 1.3 percent for the 5 percent COHb target level, 13 ± 1.6 percent for the 10 percent COHb target level, and 20 ± 1.8 percent for the 15 percent COHb target level at the beginning of the
exercise-plus-ischemia test. In addition, they report that after exercise and a 30-second coronary artery occlusion, COHb fell from 20 to 15 percent. More rigorous control of the carbon monoxide exposure and monitoring conditions might have reduced the observed variability in target COHb values. Although achievement of steady-state conditions was not a goal of this study, the rapid rate of carbon monoxide uptake (0.5 percent COHb saturation per minute) may have led to inhomogeneities in coronary perfusion, a factor that can affect cardiac susceptibility and fibrillation.

Although the authors cite an earlier study in which the degree of heart muscle damage was characterized by infarct size (Schwartz 1986), the degree of heart muscle damage in the experimental dogs in the present study was evaluated only by the placement of the initial ligature. Interpretation of the current study would have been improved if the investigators had included a measure of the extent of the infarction in this report.

STATISTICAL METHODS

As originally designed, this study had two components: a repeated measures analysis of variance comparing control, 10 percent, and 15 percent COHb target exposures in resistant animals, and a paired comparison of control and 15 percent COHb target exposures in susceptible animals. During the study, a protocol was added at the request of the HEI to study resistant animals at the 5 percent COHb target exposure. The Statistical Methods section of the report states that statistical analysis was performed by analysis of variance for repeated measurements followed by Tukey's test for multiple comparisons. In fact, this methodology was used only for the resistant group, and for those animals, only in the analysis of the 10 percent and 15 percent target COHb doses. As noted by the authors, the six animals receiving both control and 5 percent target COHb doses were analyzed separately by paired t test or repeated measures analysis of variance.

The large number of missing observations at each dose resulted in a fragmented analysis in which the sample size varied from analysis to analysis. Thus, the authors relied on paired comparisons for many analyses. Even though the authors used multiple comparisons procedures to compare control, 10 percent, and 15 percent target COHb exposures for each endpoint, the separate analysis of resistant and susceptible animals, and the multiplicity of outcome variables, imply that the study was subject to a multiple comparisons problem. The large number of analyses performed implies that some statistically significant findings could be anticipated to occur by chance. Thus, interpretation of the study should rely on patterns of positive findings and dose-response relations, rather than isolated statistically significant findings. The findings regarding heart rate changes meet these more stringent criteria.

INTERPRETATION OF RESULTS

The results of the study by Farber and his coworkers suggest, but do not prove, that acute exposures to carbon monoxide at concentrations leading to approximately 5, 10, and 15 percent COHb do not increase the incidence of ventricular arrhythmias in dogs with healed myocardial infarction when these animals are challenged with mild exercise and acute coronary artery occlusion. Susceptible and resistant dogs did not differ in their lack of arrhythmogenic response to carbon monoxide exposure. Systolic blood pressure in animals in both groups was also not affected by carbon monoxide exposure.

Heart rates, both at rest and during exercise, were found to be higher in animals exposed to carbon monoxide than in nonexposed animals, an effect that was statistically significant when the COHb levels reached 15 percent; this was not entirely unexpected (Ayres et al. 1970; Penney 1988). The heart rate response to acute myocardial ischemia and exercise was affected by 5 percent COHb levels in both animal groups, and this effect was opposite to what one might have predicted. The previously reported decrease in heart rate in the first minute of ischemia during exercise that is typical of the resistant dogs (Schwartz 1986) occurred much earlier after carbon monoxide exposure. Moreover, the heart rate increase that the authors usually observe in susceptible dogs during the first minute of coronary occlusion during exercise (Schwartz 1986) was significantly damped in animals with 15 percent COHb levels, a phenomenon that was not observed after coronary occlusion in resting animals. Although this might be misinterpreted as indicating that carbon monoxide was protective, alternative explanations for the effects of carbon monoxide exposure on heart rate are possible. Carbon monoxide is known to cause increased coronary vasodilation and decreased metabolism when compared to an oxygen deficiency of the same level (hypoxic hypoxia—the amount of functional hemoglobin remains the same but the number of oxygen molecules is reduced). This mechanism may explain the fall in heart rates noted with carbon monoxide exposure after ischemic occlusion.

The reported findings of carbon monoxide–induced effects on heart rate, as well as the apparent lack of effect on arrhythmias, should be interpreted with caution because of the aforementioned experimental problems; these include the high mortality rates inherent in the model, the small
sample size and incomplete data set at each dose, the possible bias in the animal sample tested, the COHb variability, and the lack of adequate documentation of exposure conditions and degree of infarction.

**IMPLICATIONS FOR FUTURE RESEARCH**

The role of carbon monoxide–induced hypoxia in inducing ventricular arrhythmias and fibrillation still needs careful evaluation to determine whether or not arrhythmias induced by ischemia can be aggravated by exposure to carbon monoxide. Future studies in laboratory animals need to include strict controls for respiration and metabolism levels, exposure conditions, and surgical preparations. Such factors cannot be held constant in human clinical trials, but, when controlled for, are advantages of studies in animals.

**CONCLUSIONS**

The effect of acute exposure to carbon monoxide on heart rate and cardiac arrhythmias was examined in dogs with healed myocardial infarctions and acute myocardial ischemia. The results suggest, but do not prove, that short-term exposure to high levels of carbon monoxide has no effect on the incidence of ventricular fibrillation under these experimental conditions. Heart rate, however, was affected. The authors report that heart rates were elevated in animals exposed for short periods of time to high levels of carbon monoxide (resulting in 15 percent COHb), and that the typical heart rate responses observed during ischemia and exercise in this model were modified in an unexpected way. Given the small sample size in the different subgroups, the high mortality inherent in the experimental system, and other technical limitations, these results should not be directly extrapolated to human subjects with coronary artery disease. The findings are preliminary and require confirmation in a well characterized experimental preparation.

**REFERENCES**


# LIST OF HEI PUBLICATIONS

## Special Reports

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Publication Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Gasoline Vapor Exposure and Human Cancer: Evaluation of Existing Scientific Information and Recommendations for Future Research</td>
<td>September 1985</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Automotive Methanol Vapors and Human Health: An Evaluation of Existing Scientific Information and Issues for Future Research</td>
<td>May 1987</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gasoline Vapor Exposure and Human Cancer: Evaluation of Existing Scientific Information and Recommendations for Future Research (Supplement)</td>
<td>January 1988</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Research Reports

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Report No.</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Principal Investigator</th>
<th>Publication Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Estimation of Risk of Glucose 6-Phosphate Dehydrogenase-Deficient Red Cells to Ozone and Nitrogen Dioxide</td>
<td>M. Amoruso</td>
<td>August 1985</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Disposition and Metabolism of Free and Particle-Associated Nitropyrenes After Inhalation</td>
<td>J. Bond</td>
<td>February 1986</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Transport of Macromolecules and Particles at Target Sites for Deposition of Air Pollutants</td>
<td>T. Crocker</td>
<td>February 1986</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>The Metabolic Activation and DNA Adducts of Dinitropyrenes</td>
<td>F.A. Beland</td>
<td>August 1986</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>An Investigation into the Effect of a Ceramic Particle Trap on the Chemical Mutagens in Diesel Exhaust</td>
<td>S.T. Bagley</td>
<td>January 1987</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Effect of Nitrogen Dioxide, Ozone, and Peroxyacetyl Nitrate on Metabolic and Pulmonary Function</td>
<td>D.M. Drechsler-Parks</td>
<td>April 1987</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>DNA Adducts of Nitropyrene Detected by Specific Antibodies</td>
<td>J.D. Groopman</td>
<td>April 1987</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Effects of Inhaled Nitrogen Dioxide and Diesel Exhaust on Developing Lung</td>
<td>J.L. Mauderly</td>
<td>May 1987</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Biochemical and Metabolic Response to Nitrogen Dioxide-Induced Endothelial Injury</td>
<td>J.M. Patel</td>
<td>June 1987</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Predictive Models for Deposition of Inhaled Diesel Exhaust Particles in Humans and Laboratory Species</td>
<td>C.P. Yu</td>
<td>July 1987</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Effects of Ozone and Nitrogen Dioxide on Human Lung Proteinase Inhibitors</td>
<td>D.A. Johnson</td>
<td>August 1987</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Neurotoxicity of Prenatal Carbon Monoxide Exposure</td>
<td>L.D. Fechter</td>
<td>September 1987</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Effects of Nitrogen Dioxide on Alveolar Epithelial Barrier Properties</td>
<td>E.D. Crandall</td>
<td>October 1987</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>The Effects of Ozone and Nitrogen Dioxide on Lung Function in Healthy and Asthmatic Adolescents</td>
<td>J.Q. Koenig</td>
<td>January 1988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Susceptibility to Virus Infection with Exposure to Nitrogen Dioxide</td>
<td>T.J. Kulle</td>
<td>January 1988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Metabolism and Biological Effects of Nitropyrene and Related Compounds</td>
<td>C.M. King</td>
<td>February 1988</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Copies of these reports can be obtained by writing to the Health Effects Institute, 141 Portland Street, Suite 7300, Cambridge, MA 02139.
# LIST OF HEI PUBLICATIONS

## Research Reports

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Report No.</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Principal Investigator</th>
<th>Publication Date</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Studies on the Metabolism and Biological Effects of Nitropyrene and Related Nitro-polycyclic Aromatic Compounds in Diploid Human Fibroblasts</td>
<td>V.M. Maher</td>
<td>March 1988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Respiratory Infections in Coal Miners Exposed to Nitrogen Oxides</td>
<td>M. Jacobsen</td>
<td>July 1988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Factors Affecting Possible Carcinogenicity of Inhaled Nitropyrene Aerosols</td>
<td>R.K. Wolff</td>
<td>August 1988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Modulation of Pulmonary Defense Mechanisms Against Viral and Bacterial Infections by Acute Exposures to Nitrogen Dioxide</td>
<td>G.J. Jakab</td>
<td>October 1988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Maximal Aerobic Capacity at Several Ambient Concentrations of Carbon Monoxide at Several Altitudes</td>
<td>S.M. Horvath</td>
<td>December 1988</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>Detection of Paracrine Factors in Oxidant Lung Injury</td>
<td>A.K. Tanswell</td>
<td>February 1989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Responses of Susceptible Subpopulations to Nitrogen Dioxide</td>
<td>P.E. Morrow</td>
<td>February 1989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>24</td>
<td>Altered Susceptibility to Viral Respiratory Infection During Short-Term Exposure to Nitrogen Dioxide</td>
<td>R.M. Rose</td>
<td>March 1989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>25</td>
<td>Acute Effects of Carbon Monoxide Exposure on Individuals with Coronary Artery Disease</td>
<td>HEI Multicenter CO Study Team</td>
<td>November 1989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>27</td>
<td>Cardiovascular Effects of Chronic Carbon Monoxide and High-Altitude Exposure</td>
<td>J.J. McGrath</td>
<td>July 1989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Early Markers of Lung Injury</td>
<td>J.N. Evans</td>
<td>September 1989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Influence of Experimental Pulmonary Emphysema on Toxicological Effects from Inhaled Nitrogen Dioxide and Diesel Exhaust</td>
<td>J.L. Mauderly</td>
<td>October 1989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>DNA Binding by 1-Nitropyrene and Dinitropyrenes in Vitro and in Vivo: Effects of Nitroreductase Induction</td>
<td>F.A. Beland</td>
<td>November 1989</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>32</td>
<td>Respiratory Carcinogenesis of Nitroaromatics</td>
<td>R.C. Moon</td>
<td>April 1990</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>33</td>
<td>Markers of Exposure to Diesel Exhaust in Railroad Workers</td>
<td>M.B. Schenker</td>
<td>October 1990</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>34</td>
<td>Metabolic Activation of Nitropyrene and Diesel Particulate Extracts</td>
<td>A.M. Jeffrey</td>
<td>July 1990</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>35</td>
<td>Acute Effects of Carbon Monoxide on Cardiac Electrical Stability</td>
<td>R.L. Verrier</td>
<td>October 1990</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Copies of these reports can be obtained by writing to the Health Effects Institute, 141 Portland Street, Suite 7300, Cambridge, MA 02139.
The Health Effects Institute (HEI) is an independent non-profit corporation that is "organized and operated . . . to conduct, or support the conduct of, and to evaluate research and testing relating to the health effects of emissions from motor vehicles." It is organized in the following ways to pursue this purpose.

INDEPENDENCE IN GOVERNANCE

The Institute is governed by a four-member Board of Directors whose members are Archibald Cox (Chairman of the Board), Carl M. Loeb University Professor (Emeritus) at Harvard University; William O. Baker, Chairman (Emeritus) of Bell Laboratories and Chairman of the Board of Rockefeller University; Donald Kennedy, President of Stanford University; and Walter A. Rosenblith, Institute Professor (Emeritus), Massachusetts Institute of Technology.

TWO-SECTOR FINANCIAL SUPPORT

The Institute receives half of its funds from the United States government through the Environmental Protection Agency, and half from the automotive industry. Twenty-eight domestic and foreign manufacturers of vehicles or engines contribute to the Institute's budget in shares proportionate to the number of vehicles or engines that they sell in the United States.

THE HEI RESEARCH PROCESS

The Institute is structured to define, select, support, and review research that is aimed at investigating the possible health effects of mobile source emissions. Its research program is developed by the Health Research Committee, a multidisciplinary group of scientists knowledgeable about the complex problems involved in determining the health effects of mobile source emissions. The Committee seeks advice from HEI's sponsors and from other sources prior to independently determining the research priorities of the Institute.

After the Health Research Committee has defined an area of inquiry, the Institute announces to the scientific community that research proposals are being solicited on a specific topic. Applications are reviewed first for scientific quality by an appropriate expert panel. Then they are reviewed by the Health Research Committee both for quality and for relevance to HEI's mission-oriented research program. Studies recommended by the Committee undergo final evaluation by the Board of Directors, who review the merits of the study as well as the procedures, independence, and quality of the selection process.

THE HEI REVIEW PROCESS

When a study is completed, a final report authored by the investigator(s) is reviewed by the Health Review Committee. The Health Review Committee has no role either in the review of applications or in the selection of projects and investigators for funding. Members are also expert scientists representing a broad range of experience in environmental health sciences. The Committee assesses the scientific quality of each study and evaluates its contribution to unresolved scientific questions.

Each Investigator's Report is peer-reviewed, generally by a biostatistician and three outside technical reviewers chosen by the Review Committee. At one of its regularly scheduled meetings, the Review Committee discusses the Investigator's Report. The comments of the Committee and the peer reviewers are sent to the investigator, and he or she is asked to respond to those comments and, if necessary, revise the report. The Review Committee then prepares its Commentary, which includes a general background on the study, a technical evaluation of the work, a discussion of the remaining uncertainties and areas for future research, and implications of the findings for public health. After evaluation by the HEI Board of Directors, the HEI Research Report, which includes the Investigator's Report and the Review Committee's Commentary, is published in monograph form. The Research Reports are made available to the sponsors, the public, and many scientific and medical libraries, and are registered with NTIS, MEDLINE, and Chemical Abstracts.

All HEI investigators are urged to publish the results of their work in the peer-reviewed literature. The timing of the release of an HEI Research Report is tailored to ensure that it does not interfere with the journal publication process.